

## Considering Caliban - The Big Debate!

### Drama

In Act 3 Scene II, Caliban pledges his loyalty to Stephano, who he believes will make a better master than Prospero. Unseen, Ariel, sent by Prospero, starts an argument between Trinculo and Stephano. Then, the three characters plot to overthrow Prospero. Caliban warns that, without his books and magic, Prospero is 'but a sot, as I am, nor hath not one spirit to command'.



Show the class a variety of images of Caliban. What kind of image do they give the audience? Explain that Caliban might actually be representing people's views of the natives of newly discovered lands in the early 17th century. Why do you think Shakespeare chose the name Caliban (clue: anagram). (More information about the origin of the word 'caliban' and colonial attitudes towards indigenous people can be found [here](#)).



Explain to the class that in this session, in role as members of the European Court of Human Rights, now based in Milan, they will be taking part in a debate. Discuss what this means.

What is a debate?

- A debate is different from an argument because it follows a formal, organised structure
- A point of view is given for or against a topic, and this is supported by well thought through points/evidence
- It is important to listen carefully to each point, and think how you can respond
- You cannot argue for the sake of arguing!



What are the rules?

- There are two MOTIONS **for** or **against** the TOPIC

The topic: **the treatment of Caliban by Prospero**

**Motion 1** This house believes Prospero's treatment of Caliban was right.

**Motion 2** This house believes Prospero's treatment of Caliban was wrong.

**Structure of Debate:**

- The class will be split into groups with five children in each group
- Three of the groups will support motion **1**
- Three of the groups will support motion **2**
- Give each group 15 minutes to record their points, and examples/evidence (use a mini whiteboard)
- They then select a spokesperson to argue their point and send to the front
- The debate will be opened up to the floor (the rest of the class) who can ask questions
- Finally the class will vote for the motion that was best supported.
- Teacher (or an able pupil) can be in role as the judge/facilitator who manages the flow of questions

**Explain to the children what their group needs to do:**

- in your group you must come up with as many sensible reasons as you can to support your motion. (You could do this using a mind map or bullet points.)
- next you must elect a spokesperson who can make the points
- you need to write a speech that this person can perform, really making sure that he/she is supporting the motion in a convincing and appealing way – remember we want to change people's points of view!

**What does the rest of the class do during the debate?**

- make notes and jot any questions that come to you as you listen ready for your chance to ask them!

**What if I don't believe the motion I must support?**

- it doesn't matter whether you really believe in the motion – the important thing is that you are able to argue for or against it well
- don't forget you will be marked for your speaking and listening skills both as a group and independently.

**Writing**

The debate leads perfectly into a writing lesson focussed on the skill of writing a discursive argument. If pupils have not encountered this text type before they will need exposure to good models. Show the class the sentence starters (also known as discourse markers) grid below. Which of these will we use today?

Reveal success criteria:

- Introduction refers to statement and sets out the argument's intentions

- Clear paragraphs refer to individual points.
- Each paragraph will explore both the 'for' and 'against' side
- Use of specific sentence starters (see below) help guide the flow.
- Conclusion summarises all points and ends on pupil's *own* personal viewpoint.

Use peer assessment techniques to support pupils throughout the writing process. Give children time to read work aloud to a partner. Children feedback to the whole class their favourite sentence or feature of their partner's writing. This will take a number of lessons.

<p><b>SEQUENCING</b></p> <p>To begin with,...Initially,...            Firstly,... Secondly, ....            Thirdly, ....            Next,...Continuing this.....</p>	<p><b>RECOGNISING</b></p> <p>Some might say,...            According to some,...            Other people point out that,...            Some might argue that,....</p>	<p><b>EMPHASISING</b></p> <p>Doubtlessly,...Predictably,..            No one can deny/argue that.,            Unarguably,...Indisputably,...            Certainly,...Predictably,...</p>	<p><b>COMPARING</b></p> <p>Likewise, Similarly,...            In the same way,...Equally,....            Just as,...In each case,...            In the same way,...</p>
<p><b>SUPPORTING</b></p> <p>For example,...            For instance,...Such as,...            As suggested by,...            This can be seen, .....</p>	<p><i>What sentence starter shall I use in my essay?</i></p> <p><i>How shall I link my ideas?</i></p>		<p><b>CONTRASTING</b></p> <p>Although,...On the other hand,...            Alternatively,...            However,...On the contrary,...            But....To contradict this,...</p>
<p><b>PRIORTISING</b></p> <p>More significantly,...            Even more relevant is,...            Above all,..            Especially,...In particular,...</p>	<p><b>PERSONALISING</b></p> <p>In my opinion,...In my mind,..            In my experience,...            My personal view is that...,            As I see it,...</p>	<p><b>ADDING</b></p> <p>In addition,...Furthermore,...            Moreover,....As well as this,...            This is also true of,...            Just as,....Not only,....</p>	<p><b>CONCLUDING</b></p> <p>Finally, ....To conclude,....            To sum up,...Taking all this into account,....            After weighing it up,...            In conclusion</p>